

CITY OF SAN DIMAS PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES

Regularly Scheduled Meeting
Wednesday, April 4, 2007 at 7:00 p.m.
245 East Bonita Avenue, Council Chambers

Present

Vice-Chairman Jim Schoonover
Commissioner David Bratt
Commissioner Stephen Ensberg
Commissioner Yunus Rahi
Planning Manager Craig Hensley

CALL TO ORDER

Vice-Chairman Schoonover called the regular meeting of the Planning Commission to order at 7:06 p.m. and Commissioner Bratt led the flag salute.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of Minutes for March 7, 2007.

MOTION: Moved by Ensberg, seconded by Bratt to approve Consent Calendar with corrections to the March 7, 2007 minutes. Motion carried unanimously, 4-0.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

2. **CONSIDERATION OF CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 06-06** – A request to revise the existing Master Plan (CUP 89-10) for the Sycamore Canyon Equestrian Center. The request includes: increase number of horses boarded to 212 horses; add team penning and keeping of up to 50 head of cattle on-site; and add arena lighting, tack store, office and caretaker unit, located in the AL-Light Agricultural Zone. (Portions of APN's 8665-007-903, 905 & 906)

Staff report presented by *Planning Manager Craig Hensley*, who stated because of information staff has recently received, they are recommending the Commission review the staff report, take public comments and then continue the item to allow for additional analysis.

He stated on the dais was information submitted by:

- Virginia Nichols who was in support of the idea;
- a letter from the Humane Society expressing concerns and raising questions regarding the number of cattle proposed on the property;
- a memo regarding issues raised by the Equestrian Commission the previous evening at their meeting which were similar to those expressed by the Humane Society; and
- an e-mail from Kathleen Lynn who was concerned about the proposed number of cattle.

Vice-Chairman Schoonover asked if the applicant had received a copy of the letter from the Humane Society.

Manager Hensley stated the applicant has been in contact with the City Manager's office and was aware of the concerns raised. The proposal before the Commission was to update the original Conditional Use Permit approved in 1989. When the Adairs, who have been the operators of the equestrian center, renegotiated their lease in 2005, one of the conditions was to review and update the CUP and create a Master Plan for future growth. He outlined the proposed revisions listed in the staff report on Page 2.

The item that seems to be causing the most concern is the addition of team roping and penning activities, and keeping up to 50 head of cattle on the property for this purpose. Both the Humane Society and Equestrian Commission have raised questions about the proposal, which is why staff is recommending the public hearing be opened to see if there are any additional questions that need analysis, and then continue the hearing so that staff has time to speak with the Humane Society about the team penning and roping activities.

Manager Hensley stated that lighting is being proposed for the southwest section of arena. The Community Arena has had lighting approved but is awaiting funding for installation. There is also an approved application for a cell tower, and when that is installed they are supposed to provide lighting. There is a Condition that will limit the lights to 10:00 p.m., similar to the soccer fields. Staff also felt there were several areas that would typically be landscaped which aren't and are including conditions to address that. There will also be Environmental Mitigations which include items such as shielding the arena lighting, revising the current solid waste disposal plan, review the existing septic system and drainage facilities.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if staff had the answer to the Humane Society's question on if the 50 head of cattle were adult or calves. He stated that both team roping and penning were already occurring with the San Dimas Rodeo, and asked if the issue was only with how this would be accommodated on this site and not with the concept in general.

Manager Hensley stated since that letter was received only yesterday, staff has not had an opportunity to investigate the questions about the cattle. He stated the Humane Society may have additional comments that weren't covered in the letter, but it appeared their main concern was with team roping, and that there is a difference between roping and penning.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if the caretaker facility would be reviewed by DPRB.

Manager Hensley stated yes. It was not uncommon for a facility like this to have multiple caretaker units, and this would be the second one here. The Commission was just considering if it should be allowed as a use and the design would be determined later.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if they had any data from other communities in regards to the number of horses and cattle to be kept at the facility and if this was an average number you would see elsewhere.

Manager Hensley stated staff would like to analyze that further, especially in regards to the cattle. In terms of overall area, there is capacity for more horses based on the site size.

Commissioner Ensberg asked in terms of waste management, is there an authority that sets the number of animals that can be housed based on the size of the property, and have they been consulted.

Manager Hensley stated the Water Quality Control Board has been on the property in the past and there have been changes made in the last couple of years to address concerns they've brought up. They have not been contacted yet, but Condition 19 would require review by the Health Department, Humane Society and the Sanitation District. Condition 17 relates to updating the disposal plan with the increased use.

Commissioner Rahi asked how many access points the facility had.

Manager Hensley stated there are two access points on the lower portion to the equestrian keeping area and there are two access points on Horsethief Canyon Road. There is also access to the Community Arena.

Vice-Chairman Schoonover stated the Environmental Report states the closest horse-keeping to residential is 1,200 feet. Is that the same for the cattle? He stated the Conditions also require the applicant to comply with the regulations of other agencies and asked if those agencies have been notified and/or responded.

Manager Hensley stated the closest residential to any animal-keeping was 1,200 feet. He stated the other agencies have been notified of this item, and of course they have all been aware of this site since the 1989 CUP.

Commissioner Bratt stated since the addition of cattle is a radical change from the original intent of the property, would it be appropriate for this CUP to come back to the Commission for review in six months or so.

Commissioner Ensberg asked who would be the anticipated users of the increased capacity for horse-keeping and the use of the cattle. Will this be local San Dimas residents or is this being added to serve people from other communities. He also asked if an evacuation plan has been developed, and how much time staff felt was needed before bringing this item back to the Commission for review.

Manager Hensley stated evacuation was a concern brought up by the Humane Society. He would have to defer to the applicant in regards to who the anticipated users of the increased capacity would be. He felt staff could have an update by the May 2nd meeting.

Commissioner Bratt asked if the Equestrian Committee brought up the size of the corrals since the 12' by 12' size did not meet the minimum required by the zoning for the area.

Manager Hensley stated that was correct and was another item that needed to be researched further.

Vice-Chairman Schoonover opened the meeting for public hearing. Addressing the Commission were:

Pete Miller, co-owner Toyota of Glendora, 1949 Auto Centre Drive, Glendora, stated he initiated the idea with the Adairs. The Industry Hills Team Roping Club has been in existence for six years. They are a local team roping club and many San Dimas residents are here with him. He relocated his horses to Sycamore Canyon last year and would like to have the roping club at this location as well. These are professional business people who participate in this activity and it is a very expensive hobby. He felt Sycamore Canyon Equestrian Center was a very clean facility and the owners cleaned the horse-keeping areas daily. There was only going to be 25 head of cattle for their roping activities and the two acres they will be kept on will be

cleaned once a week. In regards to the SPCA, they are concerned with calf roping. They use year- to year-and-half old mature cows which weigh 500 to 700 pounds. Team roping is historically used to brand cattle or gather them in for medical reasons. These are expensive animals which they resell, so it would not make sense for them to hurt them. As far as evacuation of the site, there will be holding pens where the cattle can be gathered. There are trucks and trailers on the facility which can be utilized to transport them, and his business is located two minutes away and there would be plenty of people available to help with an evacuation.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if other people would be allowed to use the cattle if they were not members of his club.

Pete Miller stated they would be able to. Since there is an issue with getting lighting installed at the arenas, they will only be practicing during daylight hours for the time being. They also will remove the cattle from the facility during the rainy season.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if this plan was consistent with other facilities in Southern California, and if he had any objections to staff's recommendation to continue the hearing in order to continue fact-finding.

Pete Miller stated this is a high-class facility like Industry Hills, but as far as size, he has been to both larger and smaller facilities. Team roping is a huge sport and events can run for 3-4 days at a time, but their intent is to just practice so they can go to the events that are held at other facilities. It is like any other sport that you have to practice in order to enter competitions. He had no objections to continuing the item and just wished the Humane Society was present so that he could answer their questions and they could move forward.

Vice-Chairman Schoonover asked how many cattle are in the arena when they practice and will practices be held all day long. He also asked how the cattle will get from the pen in the north to the arena in the south portion of the Equestrian Center.

Pete Miller stated they take all 25 in so that they can rope one at a time. He stated they train the cattle to go the arena by feeding them there, and then they will continue to go there on their own to find the food. As to the practice times, there are usually a half dozen people at a time practicing so they have scheduled practices.

Terri Schlagel, 1235 N. San Dimas Avenue, stated her family has lived here for 20 years and they have horses. Her son has participated in Junior Rodeo and team roping. She was pleased with his association with the team roping club from Industry Hills and felt it would be a benefit to have this activity locally.

Cameron Schlagel, 1235 N. San Dimas Avenue, stated he has been involved with Junior Rodeo for five years now but had to stop because of issues associated with trailering the horses. He was taught to rope by a famous jockey and has been exposed to the sport of team roping for quite a while. He stated the group has high standards of behavior and did not feel it fit the stereotype most people have of rodeo. He felt the Humane Society may not have evaluated the situation to the full extent possible because they take precautions to protect the cows from injury. He felt if team roping was approved, it will preserve the City's western heritage and support of equestrian activity.

Lauree Adair, applicant, 1525 Sycamore Canyon Road, stated she spoke with Misty from the Humane Society who confirmed that team roping is not illegal or prohibited; they just wanted to

be sure the cows are properly cared for. As a business owner, she would not allow any animal abuse on the premises.

Commissioner Ensberg asked if the cows would be boarded there just like the horses are, and inquired as to the current number of horses boarded at the center.

Lauree Adair stated the cows would be boarded and cared for in the same manner. When they were preparing the application, they were told to put down anything they thought they might like to have even if it wouldn't be immediate. That is why they included team penning, an activity they used to take a group to Industry Hills to participate in, even though they wouldn't be setting that up right away. That could be where the number of 50 head of cattle came from because team roping requires 20-25 head and team penning requires 20-30 head of cattle. Currently they are allowed to board 170 horses but have approximately 165 on site now. The first things they plan to do under the Master Plan is to build additional stalls, an office facility, caretaker quarters and add the team roping activity.

Commissioner Bratt questioned the size of the proposed box stalls as they seemed smaller than the standard and asked what other facilities had.

Lauree Adair stated in barns the box stalls are usually 12' x 12', and she has been to facilities where they are 10' x 10'. The size isn't a problem as long as the horses are being exercised properly.

Deanna Castle, Owner of San Dimas Feed & Grain, 142 W. Bonita Avenue, stated her whole family is involved in team roping. She stated some facilities are 1-2 acres with 20-25 head of cattle, but as long as they are kept clean there are no problems. She felt the changes to the CUP were positive and good for the community.

Virginia Nichols, 401 E. DeAnza Heights Drive, stated she is a representative of the California State Horseman Association, Los Angeles Region. CSHA endorses this application as it promotes equestrian activity. San Dimas already has a good reputation for its renowned rodeo and this will add to that.

Bob Hardcastle, 319 N. Elwood Avenue, Glendora, stated he boards at Sycamore Canyon Equestrian Center. He has had horses for six years and his philosophy is to expose his horses to as many things as possible so that they will not be skittish. This would be another opportunity to educate his horses and was in support of the CUP.

Don Green, 127 Maverick Drive, stated he lives near the Center and most of his neighbors own horses. He enjoys having people ride by his house on their horses and felt the improvements under the CUP would be valuable to the City. He stated Pete Miller does a lot for the rodeo and community, and was in support of the application.

Holly Maggio, 1391 Manchester Road, stated she boards her horse at San Dimas Equestrian Center and is a former boarder of Sycamore Canyon. She felt the facility was very clean and well-kept. She is also a member of CSHA and is gymkhana chairman for Los Angeles County. She felt a lot of kids were interested in roping and that kids and horses were always a positive mix.

Barrett Smith, 1428 Butterfield Avenue, stated he purchased his home in 1979 when it was new. He loves horses, and his kids had horses, but he is concerned about the proximity of the cattle to his home. He felt there would be issues with flies and the smell, especially if the cattle pen is cleaned only once a week. He is also concerned about the impact lighting the arena at

night will have. There is already an impact from the light and noise coming from the soccer fields and this would just be one more thing added to that.

Elizabeth Miller stated she has boarded her horse at Sycamore Canyon for five years and was concerned because she felt this plan has been kept from the people who board at the facility. She wanted to know what the ramifications would be on the current boarders by bringing in cattle and did not feel it would benefit the majority of users. She did not think the Adairs did enough for fly and odor control and was concerned it would become worse if the cattle are cleaned only once a week.

Kathryn Tapp, 411 Country Club Drive, San Gabriel, stated she has had two horses at Sycamore Canyon for three years. Team roping may be considered an asset by some but didn't think there has been anything said to address the concerns of the trainers and other boarders. The arena slated to be used for the team roping is the same one used by two main trainers for jumping, and it has jumps set up in it all the time. She was worried that if the arena was turned into a roping arena, the people training for jumping competitions would be at a disadvantage because the other arenas were too small to accommodate the jumps. She also expressed concern over the route the cows would take to the arena and the impact that would have on the horses.

Commissioner Bratt asked if the jumpers have access to the other two arenas.

Kathryn Tapp stated the public arena is open to anyone in the community, and occasionally they set a few jumps up in the smaller arena when work is being done in the main arena, but you can't get the same type of set-up for training purposes as in the main arena.

Dan Molle, 1419 Red Bluff, stated the Community Arena is for use by the residents of San Dimas and there are problems now with letting boarders use the arena. If they bring in more horses and the facilities become overcrowded, then it will create more issues between the residents and boarders. When events are held at the facility, the Community Arena is used for warm-ups and is inaccessible. He was also concerned about having more people on the trails. Right now there are private property owners that allow access to equestrians, but if the number increases quite a bit, they may limit access to their property so he felt more trail facilities should be added. He stated that if this was a private club, he did not see the community benefit to adding the activity. He was also concerned about the potential fly problem from the cows because it is hard enough for the homeowners to abate their own flies and he didn't want to have to fight the flies from the cattle.

Pete Miller stated he would be more than happy to meet with the boarders on a weekly or bi-weekly basis to talk about the schedule for arena use. He is willing to accommodate the jumpers but has been to the Center on many Saturday and Sunday afternoons and no one is using the arena. As far as the club being private, it is privately funded, meaning the members pay for feed and board of the cattle, but if someone wanted to come and rope, then they can join and pay into the fund. They plan to install cattle dusters throughout to help with the flies.

Lauree Adair stated the facility is multi-use and is used for City classes, jumping, barrel racing, western, etc. When a facility is multi-use then everyone has to work together. Team roping practice would be held 2-3 days per week for 2-3 hours at a time, so there would only be nine hours a week the arena would be used for that activity. She stated she has spoken to the trainers about the schedule.

There being no further comments, the public hearing was closed.

Manager Hensley stated there was mention about the 12' x 12' outdoor stalls. The proposal only contains eight of those out of 42 stalls. Condition No. 18 addresses the issue of fly control, and before the cattle can be on the property, the drainage on the slope needs to be dealt with, along with fly and insect control and disposal. He felt with the information received tonight, staff should be ready to bring a report back at the first meeting in May.

Vice-Chairman Schoonover re-opened the public hearing.

RESOLUTION PC-1355

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN DIMAS APPROVING CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT 06-06, A REQUEST BY DANNY AND LAUREE ADAIR TO OPERATE AN EQUESTRIAN CENTER FOR THE BOARDING OF HORSES AND RELATED ACTIVITIES ON THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1525 SYCAMORE CANYON ROAD (PORTIONS OF APN'S 8665-007-903, 905 & 906)

MOTION: Moved by Ensberg, seconded by Bratt to continue the public hearing to the first meeting in May 2007. Motion carried unanimously, 4-0.

COMMISSION BUSINESS

3. REORGANIZATION OF COMMISSION

Manager Hensley stated that with the election of Chairman Badar to the City Council, the Commission needed to select a new Chairman and opened the floor for nominations.

MOTION: Moved by Ensberg, seconded by Bratt to nominate Vice-Chairman Schoonover for Chairman. There being no further nominations, the motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Schoonover opened the floor for nominations for Vice-Chairman.

MOTION: Moved by Schoonover, seconded by Ensberg to nominate Commissioner Bratt to the position of Vice-Chairman. There being no further nominations, the motion carried unanimously.

ORAL COMMUNICATION

4. Planning Manager

Chairman Schoonover asked if there was an update on the Canyon Center.

Manager Hensley stated the City still has not received an official application, though he has heard the owner is going to propose some type of attached multi-family project.

5. Members of the Audience

No communications were made.

6. Planning Commission

- a. Report on Meetings

Commissioner Rahi stated that he and Chairman Schoonover attended the Planners Institute in San Diego. He thought the opening session regarding housing needs was informational. His sessions included a visit to the Gas Lamp District to view the revitalization, discussion on the High Cost of Free Parking and Street Mall Makeovers – Frumpy to Fabulous. He thought the majority of attendees were from Southern California and missed the diversity of the Northern California members found at the Monterrey conference.

Chairman Schoonover stated he felt last year had more topics of interest and better speakers, but every session he attended was overflow, probably because of the limited room size. He attended sessions regarding mansionization and eminent domain. He stated the League was sponsoring legislation this coming year regarding eminent domain that will protect good projects

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Moved by Bratt, Ensberg, seconded by Bratt to adjourn. Motion carried unanimously, 4-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m. to the regular Planning Commission meeting scheduled for April 18, 2007 at 7:00 p.m.

James Schoonover, Chairman
San Dimas Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Craig Hensley
Planning Manager

Approved: May 2, 2007